



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 17, 2010

Ms. Angela M. DeLuca
Assistant City Attorney
City of Bryan
P.O. Box 1000
Bryan, Texas 77805

OR2010-06990

Dear Ms. DeLuca:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 379492.

The Bryan Police Department (the "department") received a request for "[e]lectronic communications . . . sent or received from all mobile computer equipped police patrol units" from 11:34 p.m. on February 19, 2010 until 3:34 a.m. on February 20, 2010. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which you have marked, relates to sex offenders who are subject to registration under chapter 62 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

statutes, such as article 62.051 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Article 62.051 requires a sex offender registrant to provide the following information for the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") sex offender registration database: the person's full name; each alias; date of birth; sex; race; height; weight; eye color; hair color; social security number; driver's license number; shoe size; home address; a recent color photograph, or if possible, an electronic image of the person; a complete set of fingerprints; the type of offense the person was convicted of; the age of the victim; the date of conviction; the punishment received; an indication as to whether the person is discharged, paroled, or released on juvenile probation, community supervision, or mandatory supervision; an indication of each license, as defined by article 62.005(g), that is held or sought by the person; an indication as to whether the person is or will be employed, carrying on a vocation, or a student at a particular public or private institution of higher education in this state or another state, and the name and address of that institution; and any other information required by DPS. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 62.051(c). This information is public information with the exception of the person's social security number, driver's license number, telephone number, all information required by DPS outside of the enumerated categories of information, and any information that would identify the victim of the offense for which the person is subject to registration. *See id.* art. 62.005(b). Thus, the department must withhold or release the information you have marked in accordance with article 62.005(b).

Section 552.101 also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI DPS maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Accordingly, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Law enforcement records relating to juvenile conduct, whether delinquent conduct or conduct in need of supervision, that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of the Family Code). For purposes of section 58.007, “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find that the information we have marked involves allegations of juveniles engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision occurring after September 1, 1997. You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 of the Family Code apply to this information. Thus, the information we have marked is subject to section 58.007(c) and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a

financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 545 (1990). You claim portions of the submitted information are protected by common-law privacy. Upon review, we agree that a portion of the remaining information, which we have marked, is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This office has also found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. You contend some of the remaining information constitutes the compiled criminal history of the individuals at issue and is, thus, protected under common-law privacy. Upon review, however, we find none of the remaining information constitutes a compilation of an individual's criminal history. Consequently, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note that some of the remaining information is confidential under section 552.130, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.² Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Therefore, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

We note the remaining information contains an insurance policy number. Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b). This office has determined that insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). Therefore, the department must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

We note the remaining information contains an e-mail address. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address you have marked is not specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). As such, the e-mail address must be withheld under section 552.137 unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release.³ *See id.* § 552.137(b).

In summary, the department must release or withhold the sexual offender registry information you have marked in accordance with article 62.005(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the e-mail address you have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code.⁴ The remaining information must be released.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free,

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

⁴We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver’s license numbers and Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, an insurance policy number under section 552.136 of the Government Code, and e-mail addresses of members of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁵We note the information being released contains social security numbers subject to section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kate Hartfield".

Kate Hartfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/dls

Ref: ID# 379492

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)