



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 3, 2010

Mr. Richard L. Bilbie
Assistant City Attorney
City of Harlingen
P.O. Box 2207
Harlingen, Texas 78551

OR2010-08023

Dear Mr. Bilbie:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 381555.

The Harlingen Police Department (the "department") received a request for the video recording, case report, statutory warning, and department policy regarding the reading of the Miranda rights pertaining to a specified case. You state the department has no documents responsive to the request for its policy regarding the reading of the Miranda rights.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

We note that the submitted information includes a statutory warning and a notice of suspension. Because copies of these documents, which we have marked, have been provided to the arrestee, we find that their release will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov't Code* § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold the statutory warning or notice of suspension under section 552.108(a)(1).

You state, and have provided documentation showing, that the remaining information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude that the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, we find that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Gov't Code* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of the statutory warning, notice of suspension, and basic information, you may withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

You also claim the statutory warning and notice of suspension are excepted under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Section 552.103 provides in relevant part as follows:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure for this information, except to note that basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The purpose of section 552.103 is to protect the litigation interests of governmental bodies that are parties to the litigation at issue. *See id.* § 552.103(a); Open Records Decision No. 638 at 2 (1996) (section 552.103 only protects the litigation interests of the governmental body claiming the exception). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show section 552.103(a) is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

You inform us the information at issue relates to a criminal case investigated by the department, and the Cameron County District Attorney's office will prosecute this crime. We note, however, the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information that is related to litigation through discovery procedures. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party in the litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. The submitted statutory warning and notice of suspension were provided to the opposing party in the litigation; thus, the statutory warning and notice of suspension were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Therefore, the submitted statutory warning and notice of suspension may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

You also claim the statutory warning, notice of suspension, and basic information are excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual

assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate that any portion of the statutory warning, notice of suspension, or basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the statutory warning, notice of suspension, and basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/eeg

³We note the information being released includes the requestor's Texas driver's license number, which would otherwise be confidential with regard to the general public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a). We further note that this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than the requestor, the department is authorized to withhold the Texas driver's license number at issue under section 552.130 without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Ref: ID# 381555

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)