



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 30, 2010

Ms. Michelle L. Villarreal
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2010-09640

Dear Ms. Villarreal: *Attorney General of Texas*

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 385152 (LGL-10-548).

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for police report number 10-7597 "and any other police report pertaining to" the requestor and a named individual at a specified address. You state the department has released some responsive information. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information

that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not private because it is not criminal history information, and therefore, may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request, in part, requires the department to compile unspecified records concerning a named individual other than the requestor. We find that this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, the requestor also asks for information pertaining to a specified report number. Therefore, because the requestor specifically asks for this information, it is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Further, you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or defendant. This information does not implicate the named individual's privacy concerns and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments for this information.

We note that common-law privacy also protects other types of information. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See Indus. Found.* 540 S.W.2d at 683. Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated that the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. In this instance, the request reveals that the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved as well as the nature of the information in incident report number 10-1182. Therefore, withholding only the individual's identity or certain details of the incident from the requestor would not preserve the subject individual's common-law right of privacy. Accordingly, to protect the privacy of the individual to whom the information relates, the department must withhold incident report number 10-1182 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You claim that the marked portions of report number 10-7597 are excepted under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere

with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the information you have marked in report number 10-7597 relates to a pending criminal case. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that release of the marked portions of report number 10-7597 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked in report number 10-7597 under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Report number 10-1182 must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department may withhold the information you have marked in report number 10-7597 under section 552.108(a)(1). The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining arguments.

Ref: ID# 385152

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)