



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 16, 2010

Ms. Laura C. Rodriguez
Attorneys for Southwest Independent School District
Walsh, Anderson, Brown, Gallegos and Green, P.C.
P.O. Box 460606
San Antonio, Texas 78246

OR2010-10591

Dear Ms. Rodriguez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 385102.

The Southwest Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for all records generated from the district's fingerprint criminal background checks.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.116 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹You inform us the district received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may communicate with requestor for purpose of clarifying or narrowing request for information); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Chapter 411 authorizes the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") to compile and maintain criminal history record information ("CHRI") from law enforcement agencies throughout the state and to provide access to authorized persons to federal criminal history records. *See id.* §§ 411.042, .087. CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2).

In 2007, the Legislature enacted section 411.0845 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) The [DPS] shall establish an electronic clearinghouse and subscription service to provide criminal history record information to a particular person entitled to receive criminal history record information and updates to a particular record to which the person has subscribed under this subchapter.

(b) On receiving a request for criminal history record information from a person entitled to such information under this subchapter, the [DPS] shall provide through the electronic clearinghouse:

(1) the criminal history record information reported to the [DPS] or the Federal Bureau of Investigation relating to the individual who is the subject of the request; or

(2) a statement that the individual who is the subject of the request does not have any criminal history record information reported to the [DPS] or the Federal Bureau of Investigation.

...

(d) The [DPS] shall ensure that the information described by Subsection (b) is provided only to a person otherwise entitled to obtain criminal history record information under this subchapter. Information collected under this section is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act].

Id. § 411.0845(a)-(b), (d). Pursuant to section 22.083(a-1) of the Education Code, a school district is authorized to obtain this CHRI from the DPS. *See* Educ. Code § 22.083(a-1)(1); *see also* Gov't Code § 411.097(d) (stating that CHRI obtained by a school district in its original form or any subsequent form is not subject to disclosure under the Act), .084(c) (agency may not confirm the existence or nonexistence of CHRI to any person that is not eligible to receive the information). You assert the requested documents contain the results of fingerprint based criminal history record checks obtained by the district pursuant to

section 411.0845 and identify the individuals who have criminal histories. You argue that because the documents on their face confirm the existence of criminal history for a particular person, the documents are excepted from disclosure. Based on your representations and our review, we find that portions of the information at issue are confidential under section 411.0845 of the Government Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, we find that you have failed to demonstrate how the remaining information at issue constitutes CHRI that DPS provided to the district. Consequently, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

You also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.08391 of the Education Code. Subchapter C of chapter 22 of the Education Code addresses criminal history records of school district employees and volunteers. Section 22.08391 of the Education Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information collected about a person to comply with this subchapter, including the person's name, address, phone number, social security number, driver's license number, other identification number, and fingerprint records:

(1) may not be released except:

(A) to comply with this subchapter;

(B) by court order; or

(C) with the consent of the person who is the subject of the information;

(2) is not subject to disclosure as provided by Chapter 552, Government Code; and

(3) shall be destroyed by the requestor or any subsequent holder of the information not later than the first anniversary of the date the information is received.

...

(d) Any criminal history record information received by a school district, charter school, private school, regional education service center, commercial transportation company, or education shared services arrangement or an entity that contracts to provide services to a school district, charter school, or

shared services arrangement as provided by this subchapter is subject to Section 411.097(d), Government Code.

Educ. Code § 22.08391(a), (d). Upon review, we find that you have failed to demonstrate how section 22.08391 of the Education Code is applicable to any of the remaining information. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.08391 of the Education Code.

Next, you assert the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.116 of the Government Code. Section 552.116 provides as follows:

(a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) 'Audit' means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) 'Audit working paper' includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the submitted information consists of audit working papers "as they are documents maintained by the [d]istrict as part of a state-mandated audit

concerning criminal background history checks conducted by the [d]istrict.” We note that the information at issue consists of an employee’s resignation documents, a Texas Education Agency investigation letter, and an Agreed Final Order between the employee and the State Board for Educator Certification. The district has not demonstrated that this information was prepared or is maintained in conducting an audit for the purposes of section 552.116. Therefore, the district may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). Section 552.102 is applicable to information that relates to public officials and employees. *See* Open Records Decision No. 327 at 2 (1982) (anything relating to employee’s employment and its terms constitutes information relevant to person’s employment relationship and is part of employee’s personnel file). In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers*, 652 S.W.2d 546 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref’d n.r.e.), the court ruled that the test to be applied to information claimed to be protected under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test formulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 677 (Tex. 1976).

Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. We note, however, the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we find the remaining information either is not intimate or embarrassing or is of legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the CHRI we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.0845 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sarah Casterline", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/tp

Ref: ID# 385102

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)