



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 20, 2010

Mr. Tyler F. Wallach
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2010-10769

Dear Mr. Wallach:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#387160 (Fort Worth PIR No. W000148).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for all documentation related to any and all vehicles owned and operated by the city whose photographs were taken running a red light at any and all red light cameras in the city during the six months prior to the request.¹ You state you have released some of the responsive information to the requestor. You state you have redacted Texas issued license plate numbers and license years from the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code pursuant to the previous determinations issued to the city in Open Records Letter Nos. 2006-14726 (2006) and 2007-00198 (2007). *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001). You additionally assert you have redacted the portions of photographs that reveal Texas license plate numbers pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open

¹You note that the city received a clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing that if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.136, and 552.151 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. You state the city is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files, a police officer’s civil service file that the civil service director is required to maintain, and an internal file that the police department may maintain for its own use. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer’s misconduct and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *See* Local Gov’t Code §§ 143.051-.055. Such records are subject to release under chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, a document relating to an officer’s alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service personnel file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(b). Information that reasonably relates to an officer’s employment relationship with the police department and that is maintained in a police department’s internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Texas Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You state the city’s police department maintains the information in Exhibit C in the city police department’s internal files pursuant to section 143.089(g). You state this information

²We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684, a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including the portions of the photographs that reveal Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

relates to internal investigations that did not result in disciplinary action. Based on your representation and our review, we agree the city must withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.151 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.151. You inform us that the notices of violation in Exhibit D contain photographs and details of unmarked police cars, which are classified as undercover police vehicles. You argue that release of this information would endanger the undercover officers operating the vehicles. Upon review, we agree that the city must withhold the information in Exhibit D under section 552.151 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 states that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov't Code § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we agree the city must withhold the PIN numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary: 1) the city must withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code; 2) the city must withhold the information in Exhibit D under section 552.151 of the Government Code; and 3) the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Burgess
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

VB/tp

Ref: ID#387160

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)