



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 21, 2010

Mr. Mack Reinwand
Assistant City Attorney
Arlington Police Department
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2010-10824

Dear Mr. Reinwand:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 387406 (Arlington Police Department Reference No. 833-050510).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for reports pertaining to a specified type of offense and spreadsheets or documents that track this offense. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You indicate that Exhibit B relates to pending criminal investigations. Based upon this representation, we conclude that release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is generally applicable to the submitted information.

We note that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* and includes the names of the arresting and investigating officers. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1). However, you assert portions of the basic information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law right to privacy. Information is protected from disclosure by the common-law right to privacy when (1) it is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. See *id.* 681-82.

We understand you to argue that the identities of the undercover police officers in Exhibit B are confidential pursuant to common-law privacy and "special circumstances." You argue that release of this information "would place their lives at risk." However, the Third Court of Appeals recently ruled that the "special circumstances" exception found in past Attorney General Open Records Decisions directly conflicts with Texas Supreme Court precedent regarding common-law privacy. *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Cox Tex. Newspapers, L.P. & Hearst Newspapers, L.L.C.*, 287 S.W.3d 390, 394-95 (Tex. App.—Austin 2009, pet. filed). The court of appeals ruled that the two-part test set out in *Industrial Foundation* is the "sole criteria" for determining whether information can be withheld under common-law privacy. *Id.*; see also *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 686. In this instance, the information at issue consists of undercover officers' names and identification numbers. Upon review, we find this information is not highly intimate or embarrassing. As you have failed to meet the first prong of the *Industrial Foundation* test for privacy, we conclude the undercover officers' names and identification numbers are not confidential under common-law privacy and the department may not withhold them under section 552.101.

The Eighty-first Legislature recently enacted section 552.151 of the Government Code which relates to a public employee or officer's safety.¹ This section provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from the

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.151 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

requirements of Section 552.021 if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.151. In this instance, you indicate the release of the undercover officers' names and identification numbers would likely cause the officers to face a threat of imminent physical danger. Based on your representations and our review, we find the department has demonstrated release of the information at issue would subject the officers to a substantial threat of physical harm. Accordingly, the department must withhold the names of the undercover officers in Exhibit B under section 552.151 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the names and identification numbers of the undercover officers in Exhibit B under section 552.151 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Christina Alvarado
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CA/tp

Ref: ID# 387406

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)