



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 29, 2010

Mr. C. Gaffney Phillips
City Attorney
City of Livingston
200 West Church Street
Livingston, Texas 77351-3281

OR2010-11426

Dear Mr. Phillips:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 388466.

The Livingston Police Department (the "department") received a request for several categories of information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.114, and 552.138 of the Government Code.¹ You also state, and provide documentation showing, that the department notified the Livingston Independent School District (the "district") of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released.² See Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹You also raise section 552.026 of the Government Code. However, section 552.026 is not an exception to disclosure. Rather, section 552.026 provides that the Act does not require the release of information contained in education records except in conformity with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974. Gov't Code § 552.026.

²As of the date of this letter, we have not received any arguments on behalf of the district.

You inform us that you have redacted identifying information of juveniles from the submitted information under the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code, which governs the availability of education records held by educational institutions or agencies receiving federal funds. The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental or an adult student's consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act.³ Consequently, education records that are responsive to a request for information under the Act should not be submitted to this office in unredacted form, that is, in a form in which "personally identifiable information" is disclosed. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "personally identifiable information").

We note that the department, which maintains the information at issue, is not an educational institution. *See* Open Records Decision No. 309 at 3 (1983) (City of Fort Worth is not an "educational agency" within FERPA). However, you indicate the education records at issue were transferred directly to the department from the district. FERPA contains provisions that govern access to education records that were transferred by an educational agency or institution to a third party. Therefore, we will not address the applicability of FERPA to the education records, because our office is prohibited from reviewing education records to determine whether appropriate redactions have been made under FERPA. Such determinations under FERPA must be made by the educational authority from which education records were obtained. Thus, the department must contact the district, as well as the DOE, regarding the applicability of FERPA to the education records.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides in part:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers

³A copy of this letter may be found on the Office of the Attorney General's website: http://www.oag.state.tx.us/opinopen/og_resources.shtml.

used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in a child abuse investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” includes sexual assault or aggravated sexual assault under Penal Code sections 22.011 and 22.021); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of Penal Code sections 22.011 and 22.021 as a person younger than 17 years of age). Thus, we find the submitted report is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. In this instance, however, the requestor is the attorney for the parent of the child victim, and the parent is not alleged to have committed the alleged abuse. Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted report from this requestor under section 261.201(a). Fam. Code

§ 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states that before a parent may inspect or copy a record concerning the child, any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your arguments against disclosure of the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007, which provides in pertinent part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). Upon review, we agree the submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct). Therefore, we conclude that the submitted information is confidential and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free,

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Chris Sterner". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Chris" and the last name "Sterner" clearly distinguishable.

Christopher D. Sterner
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CDSA/eeg

Ref: ID#

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)