



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

August 6, 2010

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval-Walker  
Assistant City Attorney  
El Paso City Prosecutor's Office  
810 East Overland Avenue  
El Paso, Texas 79901-2516

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

OR2010-11953

Dear Ms. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 389458 (El Paso Case No. 2010-06-03-AG).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for law enforcement records, including domestic violence reports, pertaining to the requestor's client and a named individual over a specified time period. You state some of the requested information has been released. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note portions of the submitted information, which we have marked, do not pertain to incidents that occurred within the requested time period and, thus, are not responsive to the instant request. The department need not release nonresponsive information in response to this request, and this ruling will not address that information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found that a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). We further find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You assert that the present request requires the department to compile the criminal history of the named individual. After reviewing the request and the submitted information, however, we believe the requestor is seeking, in part, specific domestic violence reports involving the named individual in which his client is the victim. Accordingly, this portion of the request does not implicate the named individual's right to privacy, and the incident report of domestic violence involving the requestor's client and the named individual may not be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy. However, to the extent the department maintains other law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note the department has submitted information which does not depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or a criminal defendant. This information does not constitute a criminal history compilation protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld on that basis under section 552.101.

Section 552.101 also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Accordingly, the

department must withhold the CHRI we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law.

We note the remaining submitted documents contain information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas driver’s license number we have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records that (1) do not pertain to domestic violence incidents involving the requestor’s client and the named individual and (2) depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>2</sup>We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver’s license numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

<sup>3</sup>We note that the remaining information contains the social security number of the named individual. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Luttrall  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JL/dls

Ref: ID# 389458

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)