



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 24, 2010

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2010-12872

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 391397 (DPD PIR No. 2010-4822).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified service number. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it was created after the date the request was received. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Next, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Under section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *Id.* § 552.301(e). You state the department received the request for information on May 21, 2010. However, you did not request a ruling from this office or submit the required information until June 22, 2010. Thus, the department failed to comply with the requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider your arguments under these exceptions.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides, in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a), (b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007, a “child” is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile only as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and does not list a juvenile as a suspect or offender. You assert the responsive information consists of juvenile law enforcement records subject to section 58.007 of the Family Code. However, the responsive information does not list a juvenile as a suspect or offender. Therefore, we conclude you have failed to establish section 58.007(c) of the Family Code is applicable to the information at issue, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

We understand the City of Dallas is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.318. You have marked the telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller that the department seeks to withhold. We conclude the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code to the extent it was furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. If the marked telephone number was not provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, this information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.318.

You also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy for portions of the remaining responsive information. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Thus, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Finally, you assert the remaining information you have marked is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state[.]" Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked pursuant to section 552.130.²

In summary, to the extent the marked telephone number was furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.

²We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Christina Alvarado
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CA/tp

Ref: ID# 391397

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)