



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 6, 2010

Ms. Katie Lentz  
Open Records  
Williamson County Sheriff's Office  
508 South Rock Street  
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2010-15249

Dear Ms. Lentz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#395978.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for all information pertaining to case #C09-09-8960. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

We note the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person, with the intent to harm or defraud another, obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses an item of . . . identifying information of another person without the other person's consent[.]" Penal Code § 32.51(b)(1). For purposes of section 32.51, "identifying information" includes an individual's name and financial institution account number. *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(A), (C).

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885.

In this instance, the submitted information pertains to check forgery and credit card fraud, which constitute an alleged violation of section 32.51. In this instance, the requestor is one of the victims of the alleged identity theft listed in the report, and the alleged offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Therefore, the submitted report is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent that it contains confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. You of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the submitted information report may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

You also seek to withhold portions of the report under sections 552.101, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147(b) generally permits a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without seeking a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). In this case, article 2.29(b) provides this requestor

with a right of access to all information in the submitted report that is not confidential. However, section 552.147 does not make information confidential by law. *See id.* § 552.147(a) (section 552.147 does not make the social security number of a living person confidential). Thus, in this case the sheriff may not rely on section 552.147(b) of the Government Code to withhold the social security number you marked. In addition, although section 552.136 makes information confidential for purposes of article 2.29, we note the requestor has a right of access to her own information and that of her spouse under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(a) (“a person or a person’s authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests.”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, none of the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code are confidentiality provisions, we will address these provisions.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Gov't Code* § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by other statutes. Prior decisions of this office have held section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code renders tax return information confidential. *See Attorney General Opinion H-1274* (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term “return information” as “a taxpayer’s identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Internal Revenue Service] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]” *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term “return information” expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer’s liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff'd in part*, 993 F.2d1111 (4th Cir. 1993). Thus, the submitted W-4 form constitutes tax return information that is confidential under federal law and must be withheld under section 552.101.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and “any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter” and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Accordingly, we conclude the submitted I-9

form is confidential for purposes of section 552.101 and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(1)(B)-(D); 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(1)(v)(A)-(C).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. As noted above, section 552.023 gives a person or a person's authorized representative a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. In this instance, the information you have marked under common-law privacy pertains to the requestor's spouse. Because the requestor has a special right of access to information pertaining to her spouse under section 552.023 of the Government Code, the sheriff may not withhold any of the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]" Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note some of the information at issue belongs to the requestor and the requestor's spouse. As such, the requestor has a right of access to her own information and that of her spouse pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023. However, the sheriff must withhold the information we have marked that does not pertain to the requestor or her spouse pursuant to section 552.130.<sup>2</sup>

In summary; 1) the sheriff must withhold the submitted W-4 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code; 2) the sheriff must withhold the submitted I-9 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code 3) the sheriff must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have

---

<sup>2</sup>We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including: a Form I-9 and attachments under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code; W-4 forms under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code; a Texas license's plate number, driver's license number, and a copy of a Texas driver's license under section 552.130 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to this requestor.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Burgess  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

VB/dls

Ref: ID# 395978

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note that the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released in this instance. See Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29, Gov't Code § 552.023. Because such information is confidential with respect to the general public, if the sheriff receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the sheriff must again seek a ruling from this office.