



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 7, 2010

Ms. Anne M. Constantine
Legal Counsel
Dallas/Fort Worth International Airport
P.O. Box 619428
DFW Airport, Texas 75261-9428

OR2010-15326

Dear Ms. Constantine:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 395969.

The Dallas Fort Worth International Airport Board (the "board") received two requests from the same requestor for six categories of communications pertaining to airport concessions and TABC taxes during specified periods of time. You state you are releasing some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body receives the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. See *Thomas v. Cornyn*, 71 S.W.3d 473, 487 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.); *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). See ORD 551 at 4.

Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. See Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). To demonstrate that litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must furnish concrete evidence that litigation involving a specific matter is realistically contemplated and is more than mere conjecture. *Id.* Concrete evidence to support a claim that litigation is reasonably anticipated may include, for example, the governmental body's receipt of a letter containing a specific threat to sue the governmental body from an attorney for a potential opposing party. See Open Records Decision No. 555 (1990); see also Open Records Decision No. 518 at 5 (1989) (litigation must be "realistically contemplated"). On the other hand, this office has determined that if an individual publicly threatens to bring suit against a governmental body, but does not actually take objective steps toward filing suit, litigation is not reasonably anticipated. See Open Records Decision No. 331 (1982). We also note that the fact that a potential opposing party has hired an attorney who makes a request for information does not establish that litigation is reasonably anticipated. See Open Records Decision No. 361 (1983).

You state the board is currently involved in a rent dispute with the requestor's company. You contend the board reasonably anticipated litigation because the requestor's company, through its attorney, has sent the board two letters prior to the present requests, which make allegations against the board regarding the rent dispute and put the board on notice of legal action if the dispute is not resolved. Although you note one of the letters states, "the [b]oard and all airport executives and staff are under an obligation to preserve all communications, documents, and other potential evidence related to the [dispute]," the attorney also notes the company is "open to all avenues to facilitate resolution" and that "it is in the interests of all to avoid court proceedings." You do not provide, and the submitted information does not reveal, any concrete evidence showing that the requestor's company or its attorney actually threatened to file a lawsuit against the board or otherwise took any objective steps toward filing suit prior to the board's receipt of the requests. Thus, we find you have failed to establish the board reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the instant requests for

information. Therefore, the board may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

We note portions of the submitted information may be subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code.² Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body,” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov’t Code § 552.137(a)-(c). We note section 552.137(a) does not apply to the e-mail address provided by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor’s agent. *Id.* § 552.137(c)(1). Therefore, the e-mail addresses we have marked must be withheld under section 552.137 unless the owners of the addresses have affirmatively consented to their release.³ *See id.* § 552.137(b). As no further exceptions to disclosure are raised, the remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/eeg

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note this office recently issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including e-mail addresses of members of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Ref: ID# 395969

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)