



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 8, 2010

Mr. Tyler F. Wallach
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2010-15369

Dear Mr. Wallach:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 396547 (Fort Worth PIR No. W001068).

The Fort Worth Fire Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a named employee.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, that the department did not comply with its ten-business-day deadline under section 552.301(b) of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). The department also failed to comply with its fifteen-business-day deadline under section 552.301(e) of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1). The submitted information, therefore, is presumed to be subject to required public disclosure and must be released, unless there is a compelling reason to withhold any of the information. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). This statutory presumption can generally be overcome when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Because section 552.101 of the Government

¹As you did not submit a copy of the request, we take our description from your brief.

Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. The City of Fort Worth is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 provides for the existence of two different types of personnel files relating to a fire fighter: one that must be maintained as part of the fire fighter's civil service file and another the fire department may maintain for its own internal use. See Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g). The fire fighter's civil service file must contain certain specified items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the fire fighter's supervisor, and documents relating to any misconduct in which the department took disciplinary action against the fire fighter under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. *Id.* § 143.089(a)(1)-(2). Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *Id.* §§ 143.051-.055. In cases in which a fire department investigates a fire fighter's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against a fire fighter, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the fire fighter's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). See *Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are "from the employing department" when they are held by or are in the possession of the department because of its investigation into a fire fighter's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. See Local Gov't Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, information maintained in a fire department's internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You state that the submitted information is contained in the department's personnel file for the fire fighter at issue under section 143.089(g). You further state that the submitted information involves an allegation of misconduct against the fire fighter that was determined to be unfounded or did not result in discipline under chapter 143. Based on these representations and our review, we agree the submitted information is confidential under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/dls

Ref: ID# 396547

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)