



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 18, 2010

Mr. B. Chase Griffith
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
For Town of Flower Mound
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2010-15789

Dear Mr. Griffith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#396986 (PIR No. 862).

The Town of Flower Mound (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for all e-mails from a named employee from March 1, 2009 to April 30, 2009. You state you have released some of the responsive information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are

separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. For purposes of section 58.007, "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). We note section 58.007(c) is only applicable to law enforcement records and files. The submitted communications consist of e-mails between the town's fire chief, town employees, and a citizen regarding an incident involving a juvenile. Upon review, we find the submitted communications are purely administrative in nature and thus do not constitute law enforcement records for purposes of section 58.007. As such, none of the submitted communications may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

However, we note that portions of the submitted information may be subject to common-law privacy, which is also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We note the doctrine of common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile offenders. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 58.007. Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the town must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the information at issue contains a personal e-mail address. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body," unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c).¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address listed in the submitted information is not specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). As such, this e-mail address, which we have marked, must be withheld under

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

section 552.137, unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release. *See id.* § 552.137(b).²

In summary, the town must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner of the address has affirmatively consented to its release. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Vanessa Burgess
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

VB/dls

Ref: ID#396986

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.