



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 19, 2010

Ms. Valecia R. Tizeno
City Attorney
City of Port Arthur
P.O. Box 1089
Port Arthur, Texas 77641-1089

OR2010-15818

Dear Ms. Tizeno:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 397363.

The Port Arthur Police Department (the "department") received a request for twelve categories of information pertaining to a specified accident involving two named individuals which occurred on a specified date. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note the department redacted portions of the submitted information. Pursuant to section 552.301 of the Government Code, a governmental body that seeks to withhold requested information must submit to this office a copy of the information, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the copy, unless the governmental body has received a previous determination for the information at issue. Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), (e)(1)(D). We note the department redacted Texas driver's license and motor vehicle record information. Redaction of Texas driver's license and license plate numbers is now permitted pursuant to the previous determination issued to all governmental bodies in Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), which authorizes the withholding of ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number and license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, you do not assert, nor does our review of our records indicate, the department has been otherwise authorized to

withhold the remaining Texas motor vehicle record information you have redacted without seeking a ruling from this office. *See id.* § 552.301(a). In this instance, we can discern the nature of the redacted information; thus, being deprived of that information does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling. However, in the future, the department must not redact requested information that it submits to this office in seeking an open records ruling, unless the information is the subject of a previous determination under section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D), .302. Failure to comply with section 552.301 may result in the information being presumed public under section 552.302 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.302.

Next, we note the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See id.* § 550.065. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three items of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor provided the department with two of the pieces of information required by section 550.065(c)(4). You claim the accident report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in Act inapplicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act).

We also understand you to claim the Texas driver's license, license plate, and vehicle identification numbers in this report are subject to redaction under section 552.130 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684. However, Open Records Decision No. 684 does not apply to information in a peace officer's accident report completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* ORD 684 at 8. As previously noted, this office has found a specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. ORD 451 at 4. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Accordingly, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of

statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue in this request, while section 552.130 generally excepts Texas motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Therefore, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report in its entirety to the requestor under section 550.065(c)(4).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the requested information is part of the department’s investigative files and its release would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. You also state release of this information could impact the integrity of the investigation and preservation of the evidence as well as subject witnesses to possible intimidation and harassment. Based upon your representations, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, the department must release the CR-3 accident report in its entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Except for basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACV/dls

Ref: ID# 397363

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)