



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 19, 2010

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
TDCJ - Office of the Inspector General
4616 West Howard Lane, Suite 250
Austin, Texas 78728

OR2010-15826

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 397265 (OIG Open Records 2010-00167).

The Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a specified former death row inmate's incarceration. The OIG states that some responsive information has been destroyed pursuant to the department's record retention schedule.¹ We understand the OIG will release the majority of the responsive information with redactions pursuant to the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) and section 552.147 of the Government Code.² The OIG seeks to withhold some of

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

²Open Records Letter No. 2005-1067 authorizes the department to withhold the present and former addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of its current and former employees under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of first type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)). Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147.

the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that is made confidential under the constitutional right to privacy. Constitutional privacy protects two kinds of interests. See *Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the "zones of privacy," pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. See *Fadjo v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. See *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual's privacy interest against the public's interest in the information. See ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

This office has applied constitutional privacy to protect certain information related to incarcerated individuals. See Open Records Decision Nos. 430 (1985), 428 (1985), 185 (1978). This office has held that those individuals who correspond with inmates possess a "first amendment right . . . to maintain communication with [the inmate] free of the threat of public exposure," and that this right would be violated by the release of information that identifies those correspondents, because such a release would discourage correspondence. ORD 185 at 2; see *State v. Ellefson*, 224 S.E.2d 666 (S.C. 1976). The information at issue in Open Records Decision No. 185 was the identities of individuals who had corresponded with inmates. In that decision, our office found that "the public's right to obtain an inmate's correspondence list is not sufficient to overcome the first amendment right of the inmate's correspondents to maintain communication with him free of the threat of public exposure." ORD 185 at 2. Implicit in this holding is the fact that an individual's association with an inmate may be intimate or embarrassing. In Open Records Decision Nos. 428 and 430, our office determined that inmate visitor and mail logs that identify inmates and those who choose to visit or correspond with inmates are protected by constitutional privacy because people who correspond with inmates have a First Amendment right to do so that would be threatened if their names were released. ORD 430, 428. The rights of those individuals to anonymity was found to outweigh the public's interest in this information. ORD 185; see ORD 430 (list of inmate visitors protected by constitutional privacy of both inmate and visitors). Although the inmate at issue is deceased and his privacy rights lapsed at death, the separate privacy interests of his visitors and correspondents in their association with him are protected by constitutional privacy. Upon review, we find that the department must withhold the visitor information and the identities of correspondents, which we have marked, under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. As we are able to make this determination, we do not address your remaining argument.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 397265

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)