



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

October 21, 2010

Ms. Teresa J. Brown
Senior Open Records Assistant
City of Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2010-16023

Dear Ms. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 397636 (ORR # MCKC072910).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for all police reports and transcripts from a specified time period that pertain to a specified address and all police reports pertaining to two named individuals. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrines of common-law privacy and constitutional privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683.

Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

We agree some of the information you highlighted, as well as the additional information we have marked, is highly embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information you highlighted is subject to the doctrine of common-law privacy; consequently, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis. Further, you have not demonstrated, nor can we discern, how any the remaining information you highlighted falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy; thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the Texas driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²In Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), this office issued a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James McGuire
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JM/dls

Ref: ID# 397636

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)