



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 22, 2010

Mr. Les Trobman
General Counsel
Texas Commission on Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 13087
Austin, Texas 78711-3087

OR2010-16048

Dear Mr. Trobman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 397844 (PIR# 10.08.04.06).

The Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (the "commission") received a request for specified types of records during a specified time period pertaining to allegations against the Rio Grande Water Master, and all records generated during a subsequent specified time period regarding the same allegations. You state the commission has provided some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, and 552.116 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You claim a portion of the submitted information is protected by the attorney-client privilege. Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information that comes within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 6-7 (2002). First, a governmental body must demonstrate the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made "for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services" to the client governmental body. *See* TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or

facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *See In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. *See* TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1)(A)-(E). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a confidential communication, *id.* 503(b)(1), meaning it was “not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the intent of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *See Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, no pet.). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state the e-mails and attachments submitted as Attachment C.2 are communications between a commission attorney and commission officials that were made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services. You also state the communications were made in confidence, and that confidentiality has been maintained. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the submitted e-mails and attachments. Thus, the commission may withhold Attachment C.2 under section 552.107 of the Government Code.

Section 552.116 of the Government Code provides:

- (a) An audit working paper of an audit of the state auditor or the auditor of a state agency, an institution of higher education as defined by Section 61.003, Education Code, a county, a municipality, a school district, or a joint board operating under Section 22.074, Transportation Code, including any audit relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021. If information in an audit working paper is also maintained in another record, that other record is not excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 by this section.

(b) In this section:

(1) "Audit" means an audit authorized or required by a statute of this state or the United States, the charter or an ordinance of a municipality, an order of the commissioners court of a county, a resolution or other action of a board of trustees of a school district, including an audit by the district relating to the criminal history background check of a public school employee, or a resolution or other action of a joint board described by Subsection (a) and includes an investigation.

(2) "Audit working paper" includes all information, documentary or otherwise, prepared or maintained in conducting an audit or preparing an audit report, including:

(A) intra-agency and interagency communications; and

(B) drafts of the audit report or portions of those drafts.

Gov't Code § 552.116. You state the complaint records, correspondence, draft audit reports, and other investigation records submitted as Attachments C.1 and C.3 consist of working papers created or used during the course of an audit conducted by the commission's Chief Auditor's Office. You explain the audit is authorized by the Internal Auditing Act, chapter 2102 of the Government Code. *See id.* §§ 2102.005 (requiring state agencies to conduct internal audit programs), .007 (relating to duties of the internal auditor). Based on your representations and our review, we agree the information in Attachments C.1 and C.3 constitutes audit working papers under section 552.116. Thus, the commission may withhold Attachments C.1 and C.3 pursuant to section 552.116 of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the commission may withhold the e-mails and attachments in Attachment C.2 under section 552.107 of the Government Code, and the audit working papers in Attachments C.1 and C.3 under section 552.116 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php,

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure for portions of Attachment C.1.

or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Leah B. Wingerson".

Leah B. Wingerson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LBW/dls

Ref: ID# 397844

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)