



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 1, 2010

Ms. Donna L. Clarke
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Office of the Criminal District Attorney of Lubbock County
P.O. Box 10536
Lubbock, Texas 79408-3536

OR2010-18006

Dear Ms. Clarke:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 401459.

The Lubbock County Criminal District Attorney (the "district attorney") received a request for all records contained in a specified prosecution file. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information consists of a completed investigation that is subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The district attorney must release the completed investigation pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is expressly made confidential

under other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(1). The district attorney seeks to withhold the submitted information under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 677 at 10 (2002) (attorney work product privilege under section 552.111 may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). As such, section 552.111 is not other law that makes information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022, and the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.111 of the Government Code. We note the Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). However, the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure apply only to "actions of a civil nature." TEX. R. CIV. P. 2. Accordingly, the attorney work product privilege found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure does not apply to the submitted information, which pertains to a criminal case. Therefore, the district attorney may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under rule 192.5. We will, however, consider your arguments under section 552.108 for the submitted information.

Next, we note the submitted documents contain breath test results of an individual's blood alcohol content. Section 724.018 of the Transportation Code provides, "[o]n the request of a person who has given a specimen at the request of a peace officer, full information concerning the analysis of the specimen shall be made available to the person or the person's attorney." Transp. Code § 724.018. In this instance, the requestor is the attorney for the individual who submitted the specimen at the request of a peace officer. Although you seek to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code, the general exceptions found in the Act cannot impinge on a statutory right of access to information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on a statutory right of access to information); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, the district attorney must release the breath test results to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code.

We now turn to your argument under section 552.108 for the remaining information. Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) represents the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458 (Tex. 1993), held "the decision as to what to include in [the file] necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." *Curry*, 873 S.W.2d at 380. You assert, and we agree, the present request seeks the entire prosecution file of a criminal case. You contend the information reflects the prosecutor's mental impressions. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(4) is generally applicable to the remaining information.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(4) of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the district attorney must release the breath test results to this requestor pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, the district attorney may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(4) of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹As our ruling is dispositive for the information at issue, we do not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

²We note the basic information includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. However, in this instance, the requestor has a right of access to her client's social security number and it must be released to her. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b) (person or person's authorized representative has a special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Claire Morris Sloan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/tf

Ref: ID# 401459

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)