



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 5, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-00190

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 405957 (DPD PIR # 2010-9869).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records related to control number 09-360 on a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. You have marked information the department seeks to withhold on this basis. We find, however, most of this information is a matter of legitimate public interest in this instance and may not be withheld on privacy grounds under section 552.101. Accordingly, the department must only withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(a); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you have marked relates to pending criminal investigations or prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You have marked portions of the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information that relates to a Texas motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit or Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

²We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license numbers, under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an

You have marked part of the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides in part that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). You seek to withhold employee numbers, which you have marked, under this exception. You explain that an employee’s identification number is the same number used for the City of Dallas credit union accounts plus one additional number. Based on your representation, we agree the department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Lastly, you have marked a part of the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). The department may withhold the social security number you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.147.³

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security number you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.147. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

attorney general decision.

³We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sean Nottingham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SN/vb

Ref: ID# 405957

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)