



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 1, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-01672

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 407772 (DPD request # 2010-10440).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for the employment application, personal history statement, pre-employment background investigator's report, end of phase field training records, the internal affairs records, and public integrity records for a named officer. You claim portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code, which provides:

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) A polygraph examiner, trainee, or employee of a polygraph examiner, or a person for whom a polygraph examination is conducted or an employee of the person, may not disclose information acquired from a polygraph examination to another person other than:

- (1) the examinee or any other person specifically designated in writing by the examinee;
- (2) the person that requested the examination;
- (3) a member, or the member's agent, of a governmental agency that licenses a polygraph examiner or supervises or controls a polygraph examiner's activities;
- (4) another polygraph examiner in private consultation; or
- (5) any other person required by due process of law.

(b) The [Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation] or any other governmental agency that acquires information from a polygraph examination under this section shall maintain the confidentiality of the information.

(c) A polygraph examiner to whom information acquired from a polygraph examination is disclosed under Subsection (a)(4) may not disclose the information except as provided by this section.

Occ. Code § 1703.306. You have marked information that was acquired from a polygraph examination and is, therefore, within the scope of section 1703.306. It does not appear the requestor falls into any of the categories of individuals who are authorized to receive the polygraph information under section 1703.306(a). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which makes medical records confidential. *See id.* § 159.001. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We also have concluded when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Upon review, we agree the submitted information contains medical records subject to the MPA. Accordingly, we conclude the medical records you have marked may only be disclosed in accordance with the MPA.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 611.002(a) of the Health and Safety Code, which provides “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.” Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a). Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *See id.* § 611.001(2). Upon review, we agree a portion of the remaining information consists of mental health records. Accordingly, the department must withhold the mental health records, which you have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 611.002(a) of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Id. § 773.091(b), (g). You assert a portion of the remaining information constitutes EMS records maintained by an EMS provider documenting emergency medical services provided to a patient by EMS personnel. Upon review, we agree the information you have marked constitutes EMS records that are confidential under section 773.091. Therefore, the department must withhold the marked EMS records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093; Open Records Decision No. 632 (1995).

Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See id.* at 683. This office has also found a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In addition, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the remaining information includes information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.² Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court recently held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex. & The Dallas Morning News, Ltd.*, No. 08-0172; 2010 WL 4910163 (Tex. Dec. 3, 2010) (Dec. 20, 2010, motions for reconsideration and rehearing pending). Having carefully reviewed the information at issue,

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions.

we have marked the information that must be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to the records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and that does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.), *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). You state the information you have marked relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation and our review, we conclude the release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to this information.

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*, and includes a detailed description of the offense. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note you have marked the entire narrative portion of the submitted report as information you seek to withhold under section 552.108. However, the remaining portions of the report do not contain information sufficient to satisfy the requirement that a “detailed description of the offense” be released as basic information. *See* ORD 127. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which must include a detailed description of the offense, the department may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You note portions of the submitted information include the personal information of a department officer. Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address, home telephone number, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) adopts the definition of peace officer found at article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Accordingly, the

department must withhold the personal information of the peace officer you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.117(a)(2).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” *Id.* § 552.130(a). Thus, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.³

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides in part that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). You seek to withhold employee numbers, which you have marked, under this exception. You explain an employee’s identification number is the same number used for the City of Dallas credit union accounts plus one additional number. Based on your representation, we agree the department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136.

In summary, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code. The submitted medical records you have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The department must withhold the mental health records, which you have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 611.002(a) of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the marked EMS records under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, pursuant to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the employee numbers you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

³We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver’s license and numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara Wilcox
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TW/vb

Ref: ID# 407772

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)