



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 25, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-02848

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 410273 (ORR# 2010-11355).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports listing a named individual as the suspect and a second named individual as a victim. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy. For information to be protected from public disclosure by the common-law right of privacy, the information must meet the criteria set out by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Board*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). In *Industrial Foundation*, the Texas Supreme Court stated information is excepted from disclosure if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the release of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

the public. 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body may be protected under common-law privacy. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989). Determinations under common-law privacy must be made on a case-by-case basis. *See Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685 (whether matter is of legitimate interest to public can be considered only in context of each particular case); Open Records Decision No. 373 at 4 (1983). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, in this instance, we find there is a legitimate public interest in the remaining information you have marked in the context of the submitted reports. Therefore, because this information is of legitimate public interest, the department may not withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must withhold (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and (2) the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

²We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

³We note because section 552.130 of the Government Code protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to his client's Texas motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987). We further note you have marked a social security number within the remaining information. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/tf

Ref: ID# 410273

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)