



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 18, 2011

Ms. Cara Leahy White
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, Elam
For the Azle Police Department
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107-4654

OR2011-05376

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 414734.

The Azle Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all information relating to a specified arrest. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency

to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information, which we have marked, consist of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information you have marked constitutes CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the remaining information you have marked may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services [(“EMS”)] personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Upon review, we agree the information you have marked constitutes EMS records maintained by an EMS provider documenting emergency medical services provided to a patient by EMS and, therefore, are generally confidential under section 773.091. We note that records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient's behalf for the release of confidential information.” *Id.*

§§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. You do not indicate that the department has received the written consent of either the patient or other authorized persons. Therefore, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the department must withhold the submitted EMS records you have marked under section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code in conjunction with section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy. For information to be protected from public disclosure by the common-law right of privacy, the information must meet the criteria set out by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation v. Texas Industrial Accident Board*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). In *Industrial Foundation*, the Texas Supreme Court stated information is excepted from disclosure if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the release of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual's criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See Gov't Code § 411.081(b)*. We also note that records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted audio recordings is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. The department must withhold the information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted audio recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law informer's privilege, which Texas courts have long recognized. *See Aguilar v. State*, 444 S.W.2d 935, 937 (Tex. Crim. App. 1969). The informer's privilege protects from disclosure the identities of persons who report activities over which the governmental body has criminal or quasi-criminal law-enforcement authority, provided the subject of the information does not

already know the informer's identity. *See* Open Records Decision No. 208 at 1-2 (1978). The informer's privilege protects the identities of individuals who report violations of statutes to the police or similar law-enforcement agencies, as well as those who report violations of statutes with civil or criminal penalties to "administrative officials having a duty of inspection or of law enforcement within their particular spheres." Open Records Decision No. 279 at 1-2 (1981). The report must be of a violation of a criminal or civil statute. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 582 at 2 (1990), 515 at 4 (1988). However, individuals who provide information in the course of an investigation but do not make the initial report of the violation are not informants for the purposes of claiming the informer's privilege. The privilege excepts the informer's statement only to the extent necessary to protect that informer's identity. Open Records Decision No. 549 at 5 (1990). We note the informer's privilege does not apply where the informer's identity is known to the individual who is the subject of the complaint. *See* Open Records Decision No. 208 at 1-2 (1978).

You seek to withhold the identities and identifying information of the complainant and the witnesses involved in the department's investigation of public intoxication, which carries a criminal penalty. However, some of the individuals you have marked are witnesses who provided information during the course of the investigation but did not make the initial report of the violation. Further, review of the submitted information reveals the individuals who are the subject of the complaint know the identity of the complainant. Accordingly, we find you have failed to establish the informer's privilege is applicable to any of the information you have marked, and the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 on that basis.

Finally, you assert some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). The department must withhold the information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted audio recordings under section 552.130.¹

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, the department must withhold the EMS records you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted

¹This office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies, which authorizes withholding of ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license and license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

audio recordings under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked in the submitted documents and indicated in the submitted audio recordings under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kate Hartfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/em

Ref: ID# 414734

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)