



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

May 2, 2011

Mr. Peter Scott
Assistant City Attorney
City of Wichita Falls
P.O. Box 1431
Wichita Falls, Texas 76307

OR2011-05961

Dear Mr. Scott:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 416079 (City ID# 44).

The City of Wichita Falls (the "city") received a request for all calls and incident reports involving the requestor and a named individual for a specified time period. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k). Upon review, we find report number 01-081519 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also* Penal Code § 22.04(c) (defining “child” for purposes of injury to a child as a person 14 years of age or younger). In this instance, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the report, and the requestor is suspected of committing the alleged abuse or neglect. As such, report number 01-081519 may not be provided to the requestor pursuant to section 261.201(k) of the Family Code. Fam. Code § 261.201(k) (stating child’s parent may not obtain information subject to section 261.201(a) concerning reported abuse or neglect if parent is alleged to have committed abuse or neglect). Therefore, we conclude the city must withhold report number 01-081519 in its entirety from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You assert, and submit documentation from the city’s chief of police stating, that a portion of the remaining information pertains to closed investigations that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Upon review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the

information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Company v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the reports we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *See id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we have marked information that is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not highly intimate or embarrassing or is of legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the remaining information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information contains Texas motor vehicle information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.² This section excepts from disclosure information that relates to a Texas driver's license or motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. Therefore, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.³

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).*

³We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license and license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

In summary, the city must withhold report number 01-081519 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the reports we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/em

Ref: ID# 416079

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴The remaining information contains social security numbers. We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).