



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 3, 2011

Ms. Ellen H. Spalding
Rogers, Morris & Grover, L.L.P.
5718 Westheimer Road, Suite 1200
Houston, Texas 77057

OR2011-06022

Dear Ms. Spalding:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 416183.

The Klein Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified citation. You state the district has redacted student identifying information pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code.¹ We note the district has redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101,

¹The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office that FERPA does not permit a state educational agency or institution to disclose to this office, without parental or an adult student's consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. See 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining "personally identifiable information"). The DOE has determined that FERPA determinations must be made by the educational institution in possession of the education records. A copy of the DOE's letter to this office may be found on the Office of the Attorney General's website: <http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

- (1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(1)-(2). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under

section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision”). For purposes of section 58.007(c), child means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information in Exhibit B consists of law enforcement records of the district’s police department (the “department”) that involve juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. Accordingly, the information in Exhibit B is subject to section 58.007(c).

In this instance, the requestor is the mother of one of the juvenile suspects. Therefore, section 58.007(e) allows the requestor access to the juvenile’s law enforcement records. *Id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, we will consider your remaining arguments for Exhibit B.

We note the information in Exhibit B is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code.³ Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note the district is not an agency authorized to conduct a chapter 261 investigation. *See id.* § 261.103 (listing agencies that may conduct child abuse investigations). However, you inform our office the information at issue was compiled by the department for the purposes of its criminal investigation. Because the information in Exhibit B pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As you do not indicate that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we determine the information in Exhibit B is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the district must withhold Exhibit B from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Whether information is subject to a legitimate public interest and therefore not protected by common-law privacy must be determined on a case-by-case basis. See Open Records Decision No. 373 (1983). In this instance, although you seek to withhold the statements in Exhibit C, you have redacted identifying information of students pursuant to FERPA. As such, the remaining information in Exhibit C does not implicate the privacy interests of any individual. Therefore, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the district must withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The district must release the remaining information in Exhibit C.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments for the information in Exhibit B.

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Lindsay E. Hale". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned above the typed name.

Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/em

Ref: ID# 416183

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)