



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 9, 2011

Ms. Jennifer C. Cohen
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2011-06372

Dear Ms. Cohen:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 421307 (DPS ORA number 11-0835).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes documents filed with a court, which are expressly public under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Such information must be released unless it is expressly confidential under "other law." You claim the court-filed documents are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and is, therefore, not "other law" for purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive section 552.108). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we have marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As you claim no other exceptions to their disclosure, the court-file documents must be released.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), emergency medical services ("EMS") records are deemed confidential under section 773.091 and may only be released in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091-.094. Upon review, we find the information you marked constitutes an EMS record of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient and are confidential under section 773.091. We note that records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to "any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient's behalf for the release of confidential information." *Id.* §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. When the patient is deceased, the patient's personal representative may consent to the release of the patient's records. *Id.* § 773.093(a); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 632 (1995) (defining "personal representative" for purposes of Health & Safety Code § 773.093). Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. You do not indicate that the department has received adequate consent for release of this information. Therefore, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, except as specified by section 773.091(g). However, the department must release the marked EMS record on receipt of proper consent under section 773.093. *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which provides confidentiality for medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part the following:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b)-(c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have also found when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. After the death of a patient, medical records may be released only on the signed written consent of the deceased individual's personal representative. *See id.* § 159.005(a)(5). Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Upon review, we agree that the information you have marked consists of medical records that the department must withhold under the MPA, unless the department receives written consent for release of those records that complies with section 159.005(a)(5) of the Occupations Code.

You claim the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, which excepts “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note that the remaining information includes documents that have been seen by the defendant. Because copies of these documents, which we have marked, have been seen by the defendant, we find that their release will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold these documents under section 552.108(a)(1). You state that the remaining information at issue relates to an open and pending criminal investigation. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ*

ref'd n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-8; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the documents seen by the defendant and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary, the department must release the court-filed documents we have marked which are subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Except as specified by section 773.091(g) of the Health and Safety Code, the department must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. However, the department must release the marked EMS record on receipt of proper consent under section 773.093 of the Health and Safety Code. The marked medical records must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA, unless the department receives written consent for release of those records that complies with section 159.005(a)(5) of the Occupations Code. With the exception of the documents seen by the defendant and basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Laura Ream Lemus

Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LRL/tf

Ref: ID# 421307

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)