



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 11, 2011

Mr. Robert E. Hager
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Lincoln Plaza
500 North Akard Street
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2011-06509

Dear Mr. Hager:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 418017 (File Reference # 48310).

The Rowlett Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for any reports pertaining to a specified type of complaint and named individual during a certain time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and

local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual at issue. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code based on common-law privacy. However, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007, a "child" is a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). Section 58.007 provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

- (1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Id. § 58.007(c), (e), (j). Upon review, we find the report we have marked pertains to a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for the purposes of section 58.007). Therefore, the marked report is subject to section 58.007. We note the requestor may be a parent of the juvenile suspect listed in the report at issue. If the requestor is not the parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect listed in the marked report, then the report must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, to the extent the requestor is a parent or legal guardian of the juvenile suspect, he may inspect or copy any law enforcement records concerning his own child under section 58.007(e). *Id.* § 58.007(e). However, section 58.007(j) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You contend the report at issue is confidential under section 261.201(a). The report, however, pertains to an assault investigation involving an adult victim. You have not explained, nor does the information reflect, how the information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect under section 261.201(a)(2). Furthermore, you have not established the information is a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under section 261.201(a)(1). Therefore, the marked report is not confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

You also claim the report at issue is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You assert the report pertains to a concluded criminal case that did not result in conviction and deferred adjudication. Upon review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

We note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the marked report under section 552.108(a)(2).¹

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the requestor is not the parent or guardian of the juvenile suspect

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of portions of this information.

listed in the report we have marked, then this report must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, to the extent the requestor is a parent or legal guardian of the juvenile suspect, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the marked report under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Christina Alvarado
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CA/bs

Ref: ID# 418017

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)