



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

June 13, 2011

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2011-08329

Dear Ms. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 420315.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual. You state the department is releasing some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find

that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

In this instance, the request is for all information pertaining to a named individual. We find that this request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. Such a request implicates the named individual's privacy rights. Thus, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have submitted information that does not relate to the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual. Thus, we will address your remaining arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. You assert reports 95-150243 and 95-150227 are subject to this section. However, we note that section 58.007 is inapplicable in this instance because the conduct at issue in these reports occurred in 1995. Former section 51.14 of the Family Code is the applicable provision in this instance. Prior to its repeal by the Seventy-Fourth Legislature, section 51.14(d) provided for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 181 (1977) (concluding that former section 51.14(d) of the Family Code excepts police reports which identify juvenile suspects or furnish basis for their identification). Law enforcement records pertaining to juvenile conduct occurring before January 1, 1996 are governed by former section 51.14(d), which was continued in effect for that purpose. Act of May 27, 1995, 74th Leg., R.S., ch. 262, § 100, 1995 Tex. Gen. Laws 2517, 2591. Section 51.14 only applies to records of a "child," which is defined as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). In this instance, reports 95-150243 and 95-150227 involve juveniles engaged in delinquent conduct before January 1, 1996. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct"). Therefore, reports 5-150243 and 95-150227 are confidential under former section 51.14 of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Next, we address your claim under common-law privacy for the remaining submitted information. As previously noted, common-law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.* 540 S.W.2d at 685. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987)

(illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the portions of the remaining submitted information we have marked are highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the department must withhold the portions of the remaining submitted information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. You assert the remaining submitted information is protected under constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. ORD 455 at 4. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). In this instance, you have not demonstrated how constitutional privacy applies to any part of the remaining submitted information. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any part of the remaining submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release.¹ Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the Texas driver's license number and license plate numbers we have marked in the remaining submitted information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold reports 95-150243 and 95-150227 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.14 of the Family Code. The department must withhold the portions of the remaining submitted

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

²We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number and license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the Texas driver's license number and license plate numbers we have marked in the remaining submitted information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure, the remaining information must be released to the requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sean Nottingham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SN/bs

Ref: ID# 420315

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the remaining information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).