



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 28, 2011

Ms. Linda M. Champion  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Victoria  
P.O. Box 1758  
Victoria, Texas 77902-1758

OR2011-09192

Dear Ms. Champion:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 422260 (#2011169).

The City of Victoria (the "city") received a request for all records related to a named individual during a specified time period, including case number 2011-00013053. You state the city will release some of the requested information upon payment. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82.

A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). We also find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the city to compile unspecified records concerning the individual at issue. We find this request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the individual's privacy rights. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, we note that the requestor also seeks information related to a specified incident. This information does not implicate the named individual's common-law privacy concerns as to a compilation of the individual's criminal history. Therefore, we will address the city's arguments for this information.

We note common-law privacy also protects other types of information. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See* 540 S.W.2d 683. In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses to be excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information other statutes make confidential, such as the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in pertinent part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

*Id.* § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. See Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those records. See Occ. Code §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information constitutes a physician-patient communication or a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by a physician. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(a)). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.<sup>2</sup>

In summary, to the extent the city maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under (1) section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy,

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>2</sup>This office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) as a previous determination to all governmental bodies, authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver's license number, a Texas license plate number, and the portion of a photograph that reveals a Texas license plate number, under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

and (2) section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 422260

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).