



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 28, 2011

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2011-09221

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 422005 (COSA File No. W000500-040711).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified police report. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, the governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e). In this instance, you state the city received the request for information on April 7, 2011. You did not, however, submit comments explaining why your stated exception applies or submit a copy of the information at issue until May 5, 2011. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission

dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Thus, we find the city failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Forth Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-81 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The presumption that information is public under section 552.302 can generally be overcome by demonstrating that the information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). You claim an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, which is discretionary and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108. However, the documents include information subject to sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code which can provide compelling reasons that overcome the presumption of openness.¹ Thus, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

of legitimate public interest. Thus, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") obtained from the National Crime Information Center or the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Federal law governs the dissemination of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network. Federal regulations prohibit the release to the general public of CHRI maintained in state and local CHRI systems. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(1) ("Use of criminal history record information disseminated to noncriminal justice agencies shall be limited to the purpose for which it was given.") and (c)(2) ("No agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself."). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its own individual law with respect to CHRI that it generates. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Although sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b). The city must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Act of May 30, 1997, 75th Leg., R.S., ch. 1187, § 4, 1997 Tex. Gen. Laws 4575, 4580 *amended by* Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(a)). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary: (1) the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) the city must withhold the information we have marked as CHRI under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the

²We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including Texas driver's license and license plate numbers; the portion of a photograph that reveals a Texas license plate number; and a copy of a Texas driver's license, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Government Code; and (3) the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. As you raise no further exceptions against disclosure, the city must release the remainder of the submitted information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nneka Kanu
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NK/em

Ref: ID# 422005

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³We note the remaining information includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).