



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 8, 2011

Ms. Michele Tapia
Assistant District Attorney
Dallas County District Attorney's Office, Civil Division
411 Elm Street, 5th Floor
Dallas, Texas 75202

OR2011-11427

Dear Ms. Tapia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 427219.

The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received a request for all dashboard camera videos, DWI arrest tapes, photographs, and reports regarding a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted documents include a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident;

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the district attorney with the three specified pieces of information. Although you seek to withhold this information under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code, as a general rule, statutes governing the release of specific information prevail over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. *See* Attorney General Opinion DM-146 at 3 (1992); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Accordingly, the district attorney must release the submitted CR-3 accident report in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

Next, we note the remaining information includes a true bill of indictment. Section 552.022 of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of “information that is also contained in a public court record,” unless the information is expressly confidential under other law. Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although the district attorney seeks to withhold this information under sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code, these sections are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body’s interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver), 677 at 8 (2002) (attorney work product privilege under section 552.111 may be waived). As such, sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.111 are not other laws that make information expressly confidential for purposes of section 552.022(a)(17). The attorney work product privilege is also found at rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure. The Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure are “other law” within the meaning of section 552.022 of the Government Code. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). However, the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure apply only to “actions of a civil nature.” *See* TEX. R. CIV. P. 2. Thus, because the submitted information relates to a criminal case, the attorney work product privilege found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure does not apply in this instance. You also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code, which is “other law” for purposes of section 552.022. Thus, we will consider the applicability of section 552.101 for the true bill of indictment. We also will consider your claims under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.111 for the information that is not subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

We will first address your arguments for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1)

release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude that the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime, and agree that section 552.108 is applicable. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. This information includes, but is not limited to, the details of the arrest, the physical condition of the arrested person, and a detailed description of the offense. *See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976)* (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney may withhold the remaining information pursuant to section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency.” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the attorney work product privilege found in rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure. *City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351, 360 (Tex. 2000); *Open Records Decision No. 677 at 4-8 (2002)*. Rule 192.5 defines work product as

- (1) material prepared or mental impressions developed in anticipation of litigation or for trial by or for a party or a party’s representatives, including the party’s attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees, or agents; or
- (2) a communication made in anticipation of litigation or for trial between a party and the party’s representatives or among a party’s representatives, including the party’s attorneys, consultants, sureties, indemnitors, insurers, employees or agents.

²As our ruling is dispositive for the information subject to section 552.108(a)(1), we do not address your remaining claims against disclosure for this information, except to note that basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. *Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991)*.

TEX. R. CIV. P. 192.5. A governmental body seeking to withhold information under this exception bears the burden of demonstrating that the information was created or developed for trial or in anticipation of litigation by or for a party or a party's representative. *Id.*; ORD 677 at 6-8. In order for this office to conclude that the information was made or developed in anticipation of litigation, we must be satisfied that:

- a) a reasonable person would have concluded from the totality of the circumstances surrounding the investigation that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue; and b) the party resisting discovery believed in good faith that there was a substantial chance that litigation would ensue and [created or obtained the information] for the purpose of preparing for such litigation.

Nat'l Tank Co. v. Brotherton, 851 S.W.2d 193, 207 (Tex. 1993). A "substantial chance" of litigation does not mean a statistical probability, but rather "that litigation is more than merely an abstract possibility or unwarranted fear." *Id.* at 204; ORD 677 at 7.

You claim that the basic information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code. Upon review of your arguments, we find you have failed to establish that the basic information tends to reveal the attorney's mental processes, conclusions, or legal theories. Therefore, the district attorney may not withhold the basic information as attorney work product under section 552.111 of the Government Code

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that state agencies obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information in accordance with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Upon review, we find none of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) or the basic information contains confidential CHRI. Accordingly, the district attorney may not withhold any portion of the true bill of indictment or the basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083.

In summary, the district attorney must release the marked CR-3 accident report in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code and the marked true bill of indictment pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, the district attorney may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Casterline', with a stylized flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SEC/eb

Ref: ID# 427219

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)