



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 31, 2011

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Section
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-12641

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 428539 (Dallas ORR# 2011-5202).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for the complete investigative files for two specified incidents. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law; and
- (3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2) - (3). Because the requested information pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we determine the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).* We note, however, the requestor in this case is identified as the parent

of the child named in the report, and the requestor is not accused of having committed the abuse. Accordingly, the department may not withhold from this requestor information concerning the alleged abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(3). Accordingly, the department must withhold the reporting party's identity, which we have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(3). Additionally, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law still may be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

We understand the City of Dallas is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.318. You have marked the telephone number and address of a 9-1-1 caller the department seeks to withhold. We conclude the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code to the extent it was furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. If the marked information was not provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, this information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.318.

The remaining information contains medical records, which are governed by the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001. Section 552.101 also encompasses the MPA, which provides, in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has determined when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). We note medical records involving a minor may be released under the MPA on the parent's or legal guardian's signed, written consent, provided the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the child victim's medical records, which may only be released in accordance with the MPA.²

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 411.153 of the Government Code.³ Section 411.153 provides:

- (a) A DNA record stored in the DNA database is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under the public information law, Chapter 552.
- (b) A person commits an offense if the person knowingly discloses to an unauthorized recipient information in a DNA record or information related to a DNA analysis of a sample collected under this subchapter.
- (c) An offense under this section is a state jail felony.
- (d) A violation under this section constitutes official misconduct.

Gov't Code § 411.153. A "DNA record" means the results of a forensic DNA analysis performed by a DNA laboratory. *See id.* § 411.141(6), (7). "Forensic analysis" is defined as "a medical, chemical, toxicologic, ballistic, or other expert examination or test performed on physical evidence, including DNA evidence, for the purpose of determining the connection of the evidence to a criminal action." *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 38.35(4); *see*

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments for this information.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

also Gov't Code § 411.141(10) (providing that "forensic analysis" has meaning assigned by Crim. Proc. Code art. 38.35). A "DNA database" means "one or more databases that contain forensic DNA records maintained by the director [of the Department of Public Safety ("DPS)]." Gov't Code § 411.141(5); *see id.* § 411.001(3).

The director of DPS is required to establish certain procedures for DNA laboratories. *See id.* §§ 411.144(a), .142(h) (requiring director to establish standards for DNA analysis). Section 411.144 of the Government Code provides that a DNA laboratory conducting a forensic DNA analysis under subchapter G of chapter 411 shall comply with subchapter G and the rules adopted under subchapter G. *See id.* § 411.144(d); 37 T.A.C § 28.82(a). The director of DPS has adopted rules that govern the regulation of forensic DNA laboratories in this state. *See* 37 T.A.C. §§ 28.81, .82 (describing minimum standards by which a forensic DNA laboratory must abide); *see also* Gov't Code § 411.147(b). The director of DPS may release a DNA record in certain instances, including to a criminal justice agency for criminal justice or law enforcement purposes. *See id.* § 411.147(c).

In this instance, some of the remaining information consists of DNA records relating to DNA analyses of samples collected under subchapter G of chapter 411 of the Government Code. The information in question is contained in the department's file related to a criminal case. The information we have marked appears to be the result of forensic DNA analyses performed by a DNA laboratory in accordance with DPS regulations. Thus, we conclude the department must withhold the DNA records we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.153 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10–12; *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government

Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") number we have marked constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI which must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The remaining information the department seeks to withhold pursuant to section 411.083 does not constitute criminal history information and, therefore, the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82.

The types of information considered to be intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* include information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found that a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate interest to the public. Thus, the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code to the extent it was furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. The department must release or withhold the marked medical records in accordance with the MPA. The department must withhold the DNA record, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.153 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the FBI number we have marked under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code, as well as the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cynthia G. Tynan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CGT/sdk

Ref: ID# 428539

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note the information being released consists of confidential information to which the requestor has a right of access. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Therefore, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the department should again seek a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302.