



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 6, 2011

Ms. Michelle L. Villarreal
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2011-12859

Dear Ms. Villarreal:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 428949 (LGL 11-859).

The Waco Police Department (the “department”) received a request for arrest reports regarding a named individual during a specified time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the instant request because it was not created during the specified time period. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the department is not required to release this information in response to this request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an

individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You state the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual and thus implicates this individual's right to privacy. We note, however, you have submitted information which does not list the individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the individual's right to privacy, and the department may not withhold it as a compilation of criminal history under section 552.101. Furthermore, after reviewing the request and the submitted information, we find the requestor is seeking specific domestic violence reports involving herself and the named individual. Accordingly, this portion of the request does not implicate the named individual's right to privacy, and the incident reports of domestic violence involving the requestor and the named individual may not be withheld under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI which the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code. Section 560.003 provides "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." *Id.* § 560.003; *see also id.* §§ 560.001(1)

(defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Therefore, the department must withhold the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

We note a portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state, another state, or country is excepted from public release. Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov’t Code § 552.130). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free,

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

²We note this office issued Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including a Texas driver’s license number and a Texas license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

³We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released. Therefore, if the department receives another request from a different requestor for the same information, it must seek a ruling from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023. We further note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Mack T. Harrison", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Mack T. Harrison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MTH/em

Ref: ID# 428949

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)