



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 20, 2011

Mr. Robert Almonte
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, TX 79901

OR2011-13585

Dear Mr. Almonte:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 435370.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for specified disciplinary cards and case number 11-155064. You state the department has released some of the requested information. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. You have also provided an affidavit from the District Attorney for the Thirty-fourth Judicial District (the "district attorney") who claims that the information at issue is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Both the department and the district attorney state that release of the information at issue will interfere with a pending criminal prosecution. Based on these representations, we conclude

that section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curium*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note, however, that the information at issue includes a statutory warning and a notice of suspension. The department provided copies of these forms to the arrestee. Because copies of these documents, which we have marked, have been provided to the arrestee, we find that their release will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Therefore, the department may not withhold the statutory warning or notice of suspension under section 552.108(a)(1).

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the statutory warning, notice of suspension, and basic information, the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

The district attorney also raises section 552.103 of the Government Code, which provides in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.103 has the burden of providing relevant facts and documentation sufficient to establish the applicability of this exception to the information that it seeks to withhold. To meet this burden, the governmental body must demonstrate that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date of its receipt of the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to the pending or anticipated litigation. *See Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.);

Heard v. Houston Post Co., 684 S.W.2d 210 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Both elements of the test must be met in order for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103. See Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990).

We note that the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information relating to litigation through discovery procedures. See ORD 551 at 4-5. If the opposing party has seen or had access to information relating to pending or anticipated litigation, through discovery or otherwise, then there is no interest in withholding that information from public disclosure under section 552.103. See Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). You inform us that the statutory warning and the notice of suspension are related to a pending prosecution. Thus, because the statutory warning and the notice of suspension were provided to the defendant in the pending prosecution, the opposing party in the litigation has already seen that information. Furthermore, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue on the district attorney's behalf under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that the statutory warning and the notice of suspension contain a Texas driver's license number. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)). The department must withhold the Texas driver's license number we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, except for the marked Texas driver's license number, which the department must withhold under section 552.130 of the Government Code, the statutory warning and the notice of suspension must be released. Except for basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public

information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Tamara H. Holland".

Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/em

Ref: ID# 435370

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)