



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

September 26, 2011

Mr. Robert Almonte  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor  
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2011-13917

Dear Mr. Almonte:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 430918.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to case number 11-057053. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy

of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. In this instance, although you seek to withhold the submitted report in its entirety, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entire report must be withheld in its entirety on the basis of common-law privacy. Therefore, the submitted report may not be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the submitted information pertains to a closed criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Accordingly, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, except for basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2).<sup>1</sup>

You seek to withhold some of the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As noted above, common-law privacy protects information that is highly intimate or embarrassing and is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Upon review, we find portions of the basic information, which we have marked, are highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the remaining basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling for this information is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against the release of a portion of this information.

We also understand you to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy for the remaining basic information. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. See *Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. ORD 455 at 4. The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* at 7. The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining basic information falls within the zones of privacy. Thus, no portion of the remaining basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted report under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. In releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ana Carolina Vieira  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

ACV/agn

Ref: ID# 430918

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)