



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 3, 2011

Mr. Charles H. Weir  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of San Antonio  
P.O. Box 839966  
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2011-14210

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 431752 (COSA File No. W002262).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). You state the department received the request for information on July 13, 2011; thus, the department's ten-business-day deadline under section 552.301(b) was July 27, 2011. You did not, however, request a ruling from this office until July 28, 2011. *See id.* § 552.308 (providing ten-day deadline met if request for ruling bears post office mark indicating time within ten-day period). Thus, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to

withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although you assert the submitted information is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this exception is discretionary in nature. It serves only to protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, it does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We note, however, some of the information may be subject to sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 can provide compelling reasons to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

The submitted information includes a CR-3 accident report that was completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Section 550.065(b) states, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged for the confidential use of certain specified entities. Transp. Code § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with the date of the accident, the names of persons involved in the accident, and the specific location of the accident pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4). Thus, the department must release the accident report, which we have marked, pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs medical records. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-167.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

*Id.* § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). This office has also determined when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Medical records must be released upon the patient’s signed, written consent, provided the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. The remaining information contains an individual’s medical record, which we have marked. The department may release the marked medical record only in accordance with the MPA. ORD 598.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex.1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 545 (1990). In the remaining

information we have marked personal financial information we find is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

The remaining information contains motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license or driver's license, title, or registration issued by a Texas agency, or an agency of another state or country, is excepted from public release. Act of May 24, 2011, 82<sup>nd</sup> Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as amendments to Gov't Code §§ 552.130(a)(1), (2)). Therefore, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the remaining investigation records and the license plate numbers we have indicated in the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

The remaining information contains an insurance policy number. Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or

(2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Gov't Code § 552.136. We conclude the insurance policy number we have marked constitutes an access device number for purposes of section 552.136. Thus, the department must withhold the marked insurance policy number under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the accident report we have marked pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. The department may release the marked medical record only in accordance with the MPA. The department must withhold the personal financial information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the remaining investigation records and the

license plate numbers we have indicated in the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Leah B. Wingerson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LBW/dls

Ref: ID# 431752

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>2</sup>The remaining information to be released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).