



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 4, 2011

Ms. Rebecca Brewer
Abernathy, Roeder, Boyd & Joplin, P.C.
P.O. Box 1210
McKinney, Texas 75070-1210

OR2011-14345

Dear Ms. Brewer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 431947.

The Wylie Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we address your argument under section 552.108, as this is potentially the most encompassing section you claim. Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). Section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). You state the submitted information concerns a

criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation and our review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Company v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976), and includes a detailed description of the offense. *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered basic information). We note that basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* does not include Texas motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Accordingly, except for basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹ We understand you to raise section 552.101 for the basic information. Therefore, we will consider your arguments under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (“HIPAA”) for the submitted information. At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services (“HHS”) promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* HIPAA, 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 (“Privacy Rule”); *see also* Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards govern the releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, excepted as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. *Id.* § 164.502(a).

This office has addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004). In that decision, we noted section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. *See* 45 C.F.R. § 164.512(a)(1). We further noted the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 681 at 8 (2004); *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. We therefore held the

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your section 552.130 argument against disclosure.

disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Abbott v Tex Dep't of Mental Health & Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); ORD 681 at 9 (2004); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 478 (1987) (as general rule, statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Because the Privacy Rule does not make confidential information that is subject to disclosure under the Act, the department may not withhold any portion of the basic information on this basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which makes medical records confidential. *See* Occ. Code § 159.001. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). In addition, because hospital treatment is routinely conducted under the supervision of physicians, documents relating to diagnosis and treatment during a hospital stay also constitute protected medical records. *See* Open Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 546 (1990). Upon review, we find that you have failed to demonstrate how any of the basic information constitutes a medical record for purposes of the MPA. Therefore, none of the basic information is confidential under the MPA, and no portion of it may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 611.002(a) of the Health and Safety Code, which provides “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a

professional, are confidential.” Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a). Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *See id.* § 611.001(2). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals. *See Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990)*. These sections permit disclosure of mental health records to a patient, a person authorized to act on the patient’s behalf, or a person who has the written consent of the patient. *See Health & Safety Code §§ 611.004, .0045*. Upon review, we find none of the basic information consists of communications or records made confidential by section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code are applicable to emergency 911 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996)*. These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 911 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

When asserting section 772.118, 772.218, or 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code, a governmental body must indicate whether it is part of a 9-1-1 district subject to that section, and whether the originating addresses and telephone numbers of the 9-1-1 callers were supplied by a 9-1-1 service supplier to that 9-1-1 district. *See Gov’t Code § 552.301(e)*. Furthermore, the 9-1-1 callers should be identified in the submitted information. Upon review, we find no portion of the basic information consists of an originating address or telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller. Accordingly, no portion of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or

maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b). You assert portions of the remaining information are confidential under section 773.091. None of the remaining information, however, was created by emergency medical services (“EMS”) personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision. Consequently, you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the basic information constitutes records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient created by EMS personnel or a physician providing medical supervision. Accordingly, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *See id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See id.* at 683. The common-law right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, and therefore it does not encompass information that relates to a deceased individual. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App. —Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). Upon review, we find that no portion of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Thus, none of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. We note you have the discretion to release all or part of this information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov’t Code § 552.007.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free,

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/ag

Ref: ID# 431947

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)