



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 2, 2011

Ms. Kelley Messer
Assistant City Attorney
City of Abilene
P.O. Box 60
Abilene, Texas 79604-0060

OR2011-15147A

Dear Ms. Messer:

This office issued Open Records Letter No. 2011-15147 (2011) on October 18, 2011. We have examined this ruling and determined that there was an error. Where this office determines that an error was made in the decision process under sections 552.301 and 552.306 of the Government Code, and that error resulted in an incorrect decision, we will correct the previously issued ruling. Consequently, this decision serves as the correct ruling and is a substitute for the decision issued on October 18, 2011. *See generally* Gov't Code 552.011 (providing that Office of Attorney General may issue decision to maintain uniformity in application, operation, and interpretation of Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code).

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Act. Your request was assigned ID# 433521.

The Abilene Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records involving a named individual during a specified time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) it contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is

highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

In this instance, the requestor seeks access to unspecified law enforcement records relating to the named individual. Thus, the request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and thereby implicates the individual's privacy interests. Accordingly, to the extent the department maintains any information that depicts the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interests of the named individual and may not be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. Accordingly, we will address your section 552.108 claim for this information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(a); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). In this instance, you represent that report numbers 11-011920 and 11-012105 pertain to a case that is still under investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude release of report numbers 11-011920 and 11-012105 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3 (1976)* (listing information from arrest sheet deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of the basic information that must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 11-011920 and 11-012105 from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains any information that depicts the named individual as a suspect, arrested person, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the basic information that must be released, the department may withhold report numbers 11-011920 and 11-012105 from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 433521

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)