



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 26, 2011

Ms. Cheryl K. Byles
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2011-15723

Dear Ms. Byles:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 438946 (PIR W011934).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state you have redacted certain Texas motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code pursuant to the previous determination issued to the city in Open Records Letter No. 2007-00198 (2007) and section 552.130(c).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which

¹Open Records Letter No. 2007-00198 (2007) is a previous determination authorizing the city to withhold certain information subject to section 552.130(a)(2) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. On September 1, 2011, the Texas legislature amended section 552.130 to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3), such as driver's license numbers, without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Act of May 30, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 602, § 22 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.130(c)). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See* Act of May 30, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 602, § 22 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.130(d), (e)).

protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. We find such a request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates this named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting this named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted responsive information that does not depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, this information is not part of a criminal history compilation and may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Therefore, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. ORD 565 at 7. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an

agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(a)). The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/ag

Ref: ID# 438946

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)