



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 1, 2011

Ms. J Middlebrooks  
Assistant City Attorney  
Criminal Law and Police Division  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2011-16025

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 434938 (DPD PIR# 2011-7304).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information relating to a specified control number. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note some of the submitted information appears to be the subject of a previous request for information, in response to which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2011-10813 (2011). In this ruling, we concluded with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. We are unaware of any change in the law, facts, and circumstances on which the previous ruling is based. Therefore, to the extent the submitted information is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by

---

<sup>1</sup>This letter ruling assumes the submitted representative sample of information is truly representative of the requested information as a whole. This ruling does not reach, and therefore does not authorize, the withholding of any other requested information to the extent that the other information is substantially different than that submitted to this office. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D), .302; Open Records Decision Nos. 499 at 6 (1988), 497 at 4 (1988).

this office, the department must continue to rely on this ruling as a previous determination and release the identical information in accordance with Open Records Letter No. 2011-10813. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(f); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). To the extent the submitted information is not encompassed by the previous ruling, we will address the raised exceptions.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A). We note section 552.108 is generally not applicable to information relating to an administrative investigation that did not result in a criminal investigation or prosecution. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). You state the information you have marked relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found financial information relating only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of the test for common-law privacy. *See* Open

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (personal financial choices concerning insurance are generally confidential), 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects personal financial information not related to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body), 523 (1989). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country;
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country; or
- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Act of May 24, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 1638, § 4 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states, "Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the department must withhold the insurance policy number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the submitted information is identical to the information previously requested and ruled upon by this office, the department may continue to rely on Open Records Letter No. 2011-10813 as a previous determination and withhold or release the identical information in accordance with that ruling. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information you have marked as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must

withhold the insurance policy number you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

Finally, we note the requestor indicates she prefers to receive copies of the requested information in electronic format. Section 552.228 of the Government Code requires a governmental body to provide a copy of the public information in the requested medium if it has the technological ability to do so without the purchase of software or hardware. *See* Gov't Code § 552.228(b)(1), (2). Accordingly, if the department has the technological capability to provide the remaining information to the requestor in the requested format, it must do so; however, if the department does not have the technological capability, it must provide the information at issue in another medium acceptable to the requestor. *See id.* 552.228(c).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kirsten Brew  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KB/em

Ref: ID# 434938

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)