



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 8, 2011

Mr. B. Chase Griffith
Attorney for McKinney Police Department
Brown & Hofmeister, LLP
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2011-16398

Dear Mr. Griffith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 436430.

The McKinney Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request from a Texas Department of Family and Protective Services ("DFPS") investigator for all calls for service during the past year to a specified address. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which protects juvenile law enforcement records related to delinquent conduct and conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Section 58.007 provides, in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a “child” is a person who was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time the conduct occurred. *Id.* § 51.02(2). The submitted information reflects the offender in each instance was fourteen years old. Accordingly, we find the submitted information involves a juvenile engaged in delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct”). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. *See id.* § 58.007(e)-(i). Therefore, the submitted information is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must generally be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

However, the requestor in this instance is an investigator with DFPS. Section 411.114(a) of the Government Code states in pertinent part:

(2) [DFPS] shall obtain from the [Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] criminal history record information [“CHRI”] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to a person who is:

...

(I) an alleged perpetrator in a report [DFPS] receives alleging that the person has abused, neglected, or exploited a child, an elderly person, or a person with a disability, provided that:

(i) the report alleges the person has engaged in conduct that meets the applicable definition of abuse, neglect, or exploitation under Chapter 261, Family Code, or Chapter 48, Human Resources Code; and

(ii) the person is not also the victim of the alleged conduct[.]

(4) Subject to Section 411.087, [DFPS] is entitled to:

...
(B) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to a person described by Subdivision (2) or (3).

Act of May 29, 2011, 82nd Leg., R.S., S.B. 221, § 2 (to be codified as amendments to Gov't Code § 411.114(a)(2)(I) and (a)(4)(B)). For purposes of section 411.114, CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Thus, these provisions may grant the DFPS investigator a right of access to CHRI in the submitted information. In this case, the requestor states the information is being requested for the purpose of a Child Protective Services investigation but does not specifically state who is being investigated or whether that person is an alleged perpetrator in a DFPS report of abuse or neglect of a child. Thus, we are unable to conclude that section 411.114 of the Government Code gives the requestor a right of access to any of the requested information, and we must rule conditionally. Therefore, if the requestor is not investigating the juvenile at issue as an alleged perpetrator in a DFPS report of abuse or neglect of a child, the CHRI is not subject to release to this requestor under section 411.114, and the submitted information must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. However, if the requestor is investigating the juvenile at issue as an alleged perpetrator in a DFPS report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the requestor is authorized by section 411.114 of the Government Code to obtain CHRI from the department. In that instance, we must address the conflict between section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and section 411.114 of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See id.* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App.1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, while section 58.007(c) generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.114 of the Government Code gives one specific requestor, the DFPS, access to particular information, CHRI, found in records involving particular individuals, alleged perpetrators in a DFPS report of abuse or neglect of a child. *See* Gov't Code § 411.114; Fam. Code § 58.007. Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the DFPS by section 411.114 of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Although you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the submitted information, we note a statutory right of access also prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy*

Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd., 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, if the department determines the information the investigator is seeking relates to an alleged perpetrator in a DFPS report of abuse or neglect of a child, the department must release the information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. The department must withhold the remaining information in the submitted reports under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the information does not relate to such an individual, the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Misty Haberer Barham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHB/agn

Ref: ID # 436430

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)