



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 5, 2011

Mr. Robert Almonte
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, Ninth Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2011-17837

Dear Mr. Almonte:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 438138.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified incident. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2)-(3). We find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1)(A) (defining abuse for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261). Thus, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, the requestor is a parent of the child victim, and she is not alleged to have committed the alleged or suspected abuse. Thus, in this instance, the department may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold the submitted information from this requestor. *Id.* § 261.201(k). However, we note section 261.201(l)(3) provides the identity of the reporting party must be withheld. *See id.* § 261.201(l)(3). In addition, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must be

withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Accordingly, we will consider your remaining arguments under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *See id.* at 683. You assert the submitted information is subject to common-law privacy. However, as previously noted, the requestor is a parent of the child whose privacy right is at issue and, therefore, has a special right of access to information that would ordinarily be withheld to protect the child's privacy interests. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person or person's representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to an active criminal investigation. Based upon your representations and our review, we conclude release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. *Gov't Code* § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-8; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). As previously noted, section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code states the identity of the reporting party must be withheld when a governmental body

releases information under section 261.201(k). *See* Fam. Code 261.201(1)(3). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1). However, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/dls

Ref: ID# 438138

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹Because this requestor has a special right of access to information that would ordinarily be confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from a different requestor.