



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 22, 2011

Mr. Mark Mann
Assistant City Attorney
City of Garland
P.O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2011-18881

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 440017 (GCA 11-0795).

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records pertaining to a named individual, including records pertaining to a specified incident. You state the department has released some of the requested information. You state you have redacted certain information under section 552.136 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ You also state you have redacted a social security

¹Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold ten categories of information, including bank account numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. However, on September 1, 2011, the Texas legislature amended section 552.136 to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(e). Thus, the statutory amendment to section 552.136 of the Government Code superceded Open Records Decision No. 684 on September 1, 2011. Therefore, a governmental body may only redact information subject to subsection 552.136(a) in accordance with section 552.136, not Open Records Decision No. 684.

number under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual’s criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request, in part, requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request. We find the part of the request seeking unspecified law enforcement records involving the named individual implicates the named individual’s right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note the requestor also seeks information related to a specified incident. This information does not implicate the named individual’s common-law privacy concerns. Therefore, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

³We assume that the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. However, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one’s current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law. None of the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Therefore, the department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

We note the remaining information contains utility account numbers. Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”⁴ *Id.* § 552.136(b). An access device number is one that may be used to (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value, or (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument, and includes an account number. *See id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find the account numbers, which we have marked, constitutes an access device number for purposes

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

of section 552.136. Thus, the department must withhold this information under section 552.136.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 and federal law. The department must withhold the information you have marked, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/ag

Ref: ID# 440017

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)