



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 3, 2012

Ms. Sol M. Cortez
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, TX 79901

OR2012-00079

Dear Ms. Cortez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 445970.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You state the department is releasing some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) provides, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). In this instance, the requestor has provided the department with the requisite pieces of information specified by the statute. Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, the general exceptions found in the Act do not apply to information that is made public by other statutes. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 544 (1990), 378 (1983), 161 (1977), 146 (1976).

You also assert portions of the CR-3 form are confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or county. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). As

noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in Act in applicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 of the Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451 (1986).

In this instance, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue in this request, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the CR-3 form under section 552.130. Therefore, the department must release the CR-3 accident report form in its entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4).

We next address your claim under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the remaining information. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), 301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the remaining information relates to an open and pending criminal investigation. Based upon your representation and our review, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable in this instance. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r. e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). We note, however, that the information at issue includes a DIC-24 statutory warning. The department provided a copy of this form to the arrestee. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has already been seen by the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24 form may not be withheld under section 552.108.

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the

basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the DIC-24 form and basic information, the department may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Finally, we note that the DIC-24 form contains a Texas driver’s license number. As noted above, section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state.¹ See Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). The department must withhold the Texas driver’s license number we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Except for the marked driver’s license number, which the department must withhold under section 552.130 of the Government Code, the DIC-24 form must be released. The department may withhold the remaining submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, except for the basic information that must be released under section 552.108(c).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/ag

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Ref: ID# 445970

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)