



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 6, 2012

Mr. Robert Almonte
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2012-00281

Dear Mr. Almonte:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 441826.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports pertaining to a named individual. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *E.g., see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). In addition, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be

highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The requestor asks for all information held by the department concerning a named individual. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have submitted documents that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Accordingly, this information is not confidential in its entirety under common-law privacy on that ground. Nevertheless, we find some of the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and is not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(b)(1). The submitted information contains Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") numbers that constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201(a) provides as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find some the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of section 261.201). Thus, we conclude this information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, this information, which we have marked, is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Some of the information at issue is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130(a) of the Government Code provides the following:

Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country;
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country; or
- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987); *see, e.g.*, Open Records Decision No. 470 at 2 (1987) (because release of confidential information could impair rights of third parties and because improper release constitutes a misdemeanor, attorney general will raise predecessor statute of section 552.101 on behalf of governmental bodies).

To conclude, the department must withhold (1) any law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, (2) the medical information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, (3) the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code, and (4) the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us. Therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/ag

Ref: ID# 441826

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the submitted information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.