



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 11, 2012

Ms. Tiffany Evans  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Houston  
P.O. Box 368  
Houston, Texas 77001

OR2012-00490

Dear Ms. Evans:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 441945 (Houston GC No. 19049).

The Houston Emergency Center (the "center") received a request for the transcript and 911 recordings for a specified incident. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note Exhibit 3, which consists of the incident report, is not responsive to the instant request. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the center is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Next, we must address the center's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). The center received the request for information on October 10, 2011. However, you did not request a ruling from this office until October, 31, 2011. *See id.* § 552.308. Consequently, we find the center failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although the center seeks to withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, it is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interest and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the need of a governmental body, other than the one that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason under section 552.302. Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). You assert the Houston Police Department (the "department") has a law enforcement interest in the requested information. Therefore, we will consider whether the center may withhold the requested information on behalf of the department.

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code 552.108(a). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department asserts the requested information relates to an open and active criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the center may withhold the requested information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the department.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free,

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Kathryn R. Mattingly". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned to the right of the typed name.

Kathryn R. Mattingly  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KRM/som

Ref: ID# 441945

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)