



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 2, 2012

Ms. Jessica Sangsvang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2012-01682

Dear Ms. Sangsvang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 444101 (PIR No. W013011).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information concerning a specified incident.¹ You state some information will be released to the requestor. You state the department will redact social security numbers as permitted by section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note pages 85 and 89 of Exhibit C are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, this is a discretionary

¹You inform us the requestor withdrew the portion of his request seeking video recordings.

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

exception that may be waived and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a)(17), and the department may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) on that basis. As you raise no additional exceptions to disclosure for the court-filed documents, pages 85 and 89 must be released to the requestor.

We next note the remaining information contains medical records subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Access to medical records is governed by the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See Occ. Code* §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See Open Records Decision* Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have also found when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Medical records must be released upon the patient’s signed, written consent, provided the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons

or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004-.005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Upon review, we find pages 90-96 and 110-113 of Exhibit C consist of records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of patients by a physician that were created by a physician. Although you also raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, general exceptions in the Act cannot impinge on a statutory right of access to information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, the information we have indicated constitutes confidential medical records and may be released only if the department receives proper consent from the patients at issue in accordance with the MPA.

We now address your argument against disclosure of the remaining information. Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide an affidavit from the district attorney’s office showing, the requested information pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on your representation and our review of the information, we conclude release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of a crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court describes law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code applies to the remaining information.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. Basic information must be released, even if it does not literally appear on the front page of the report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

³Because our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

In summary, the department must release pages 85 and 89 of Exhibit C pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The department may release pages 90-96 and 110-113 of Exhibit C only in accordance with the MPA. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Misty Haberer Barham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHB/agn

Ref: ID # 444101

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)