



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 7, 2012

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2012-01872

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 448498.

The Mesquite Police Department (the "department") received a request for the call sheet related to a specified accident and a separate request for the call sheet related to a different accident. You state the department will withhold information relating to a 9-1-1 caller in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2011-15761 (2011). You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note you seek to withhold information relating to lien information. In Open Records Letter No. 2012-01375 (2012), this office issued a previous determination to the department authorizing the department to withhold lien information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Therefore, the department must withhold the marked lien information in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2012-01375.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. You claim section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy,

which protects information that is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and of no legitimate public interest. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Common-law privacy encompasses the specific types of information held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. *See id.* at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). This office has determined that certain other types of information also are private under section 552.101. *See generally* Open Records Decision No. 659 at 4-5 (1999) (summarizing information attorney general has held to be private). We also have determined common-law privacy encompasses certain types of personal financial information. Personal financial information related only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first element of the common-law privacy test, but the public has a legitimate interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 at 4 (1990) (attorney general has found kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to generally be those regarding receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common-law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis).

We find the personal financial information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not a matter of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(2). We agree the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the department must withhold (1) the marked lien information in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2012-01375; (2) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (3) the information you

¹We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination issued by this office authorizing all governmental bodies to withhold ten categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision, including a Texas license plate number under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 448498

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)

²We note the first requestor has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a). Therefore, if the department receives another request for this information from a person who does not have a special right of access to this information, the department should resubmit this same information and request another decision from this office. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).