



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 23, 2012

Ms. Sylvia McClellan
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law and Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2012-02793

Dear Ms. McClellan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 446247 (DPD Request No. 2011-11113).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for all 9-1-1 call sheets and offense and arrest reports related to a specified apartment complex during a specified time period. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

We note you seek to withhold the telephone numbers of 9-1-1 callers. In Open Records Letter No. 2011-17075 (2011), this office issued a previous determination to the department authorizing it to withhold the originating telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller furnished to the department by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

¹We assume the "representative sample" of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Provided the originating telephone numbers of the 9-1-1 callers at issue were furnished to the department by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked telephone numbers in accordance with the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2011-17075.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records related to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Open Records Decision No. 680 at 4 (2004); *see also* Fam. Code §§ 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"), .02(2) (defining "child" as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the conduct). Section 58.007 provides in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). The reports you have marked consist of law enforcement records that involve juveniles engaged in conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. Furthermore, it does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply in this instance. Accordingly, the reports you have marked are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code, and the department must withhold these reports in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). We find the reports you have marked were used or developed in investigations of alleged child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of ch. 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of the Family Code). As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold the reports you have marked in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing predecessor statute).*

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has

significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the information you have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(a). The department may withhold the social security numbers you have marked under section 552.147.²

In summary, provided the originating telephone numbers of the 9-1-1 callers were furnished to the department by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold the marked telephone numbers in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2011-17075. The department must withhold the reports you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 58.007 and 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must also withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free,

²We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Jennifer Burnett", followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/dls

Ref: ID# 446247

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)