



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 12, 2012

Ms. Angela M. Deluca
Assistant City Attorney
City of Bryan
P.O. Box 1000
Bryan, Texas 77805

OR2012-03671

Dear Ms. Deluca:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 448231.

The Bryan Police Department (the "department") received a request for fifteen categories of information relating to a named police officer. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You state the City of Bryan is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 of the Local Government Code contemplates two different types of personnel files, a police officer's civil service file that the civil service director is required to maintain, and an internal file that the police department may maintain for its own use. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g). In cases in which a department investigates a police

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

officer's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against a police officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) of the Local Government Code to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a) of the Local Government Code. *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App. — Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are "from the employing department" when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Chapter 143 of the Local Government Code prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *See* Local Gov't Code §§ 143.051-.055; Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 (written reprimand is not disciplinary action for purposes of Local Gov't Code chapter 143). Such records are subject to release under the Act. *See* Local Gov't Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990).

However, a document relating to a police officer's alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service personnel file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(b). Information that reasonably relates to a police officer's employment relationship with the department and that is maintained in a police department's internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App. — San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Texas Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App. — Austin 1993, writ denied).

You state the information submitted as Exhibit B is held in the department's internal personnel file for the named officer and is maintained under section 143.089. Accordingly, the department must withhold Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1997). You state the named officer at issue is involved as a witness in a criminal prosecution. You state release of the remaining information would interfere with this pending criminal prosecution because it could be used to undermine his credibility, his competency to testify, and his qualifications as an expert witness. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App. — Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates

law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, the department may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

In summary, the department must withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. The department may withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Charles Galindo Jr.
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CG/em

Ref: ID# 448231

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

²Because our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining argument against disclosure.