



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

April 9, 2012

Ms. Holly C. Lytle  
Assistant County Attorney  
El Paso County  
500 East San Antonio, Room 503  
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2012-05024

Dear Ms. Lytle:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 449907.

The El Paso County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for records pertaining to a specified case number involving a named individual. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides as follows:

The medical examiner shall keep full and complete records properly indexed, giving the name if known of every person whose death is investigated, the place where the body was found, the date, the cause and manner of death, and shall issue a death certificate. . . . The records are subject to required public disclosure in accordance with [the Act], except that a photograph or x-ray of a body taken during an autopsy is excepted from required public disclosure in accordance with [the Act], but is subject to disclosure:

- (1) under a subpoena or authority of other law; or
- (2) if the photograph or x-ray is of the body of a person who died while in the custody of law enforcement.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.25, § 11. You state some of the submitted information consists of photographs taken during an autopsy that are confidential pursuant to section 11 of article 49.25. Upon review, we agree most of the photographs at issue consist of photographs of a body taken during an autopsy. You indicate neither of the statutory exceptions to confidentiality is applicable in this instance. Accordingly, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the photographs we have indicated under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. However, we note the remaining photographs do not consist of photographs of a body taken during an autopsy. These remaining photographs are not confidential under article 49.25, and the sheriff's office may not withhold them under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* § 411.090-.127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI the sheriff's office must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the

Government Code and federal law.<sup>1</sup> However, none of the remaining information constitutes CHRI, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *See id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, we note because the common law right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death, common-law privacy does not protect information that relates only to a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). Upon review, we note the information at issue pertains only to a deceased individual. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.007 of the Family Code, which provides for the confidentiality of juvenile law enforcement records related to delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision"). Section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

*Id.* § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the information you have marked constitutes confidential law enforcement records under section 58.007(c). Moreover, it does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to this information. Further, we determine section 58.007 is not solely intended to protect the privacy interests of subject juveniles. Therefore, the fact that the subject juvenile in the marked records is now deceased does not remove that information from the ambit of section 58.007. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007(c).

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold the photographs we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code and federal law. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index\\_orl.php](http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/som

Ref: ID# 449907

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)